Intermediate Report on Internal Quality Control

Done by: Quality Monitoring Committe

Date: 30.1.2021

Quality Monitoring Committee present:

- Matjaž Debevc, University of Maribor
- Andrej Škraba, University of Maribor
- Christian Kolowrat, University of Vienna
- Michael Wimmer, University of Vienna
- Kamila Borsekova, University of Banska Bistrica
- Vesna Čavić, University of Zagreb

The following quality check report present an intermediate evaluation of deliverables regarding the quality of available deliverables (till M24) and workflow.

1. Workflow

The workflow at the web site (https://www.mards.ucg.ac.me/workflow.html) includes following information:

- Project workpackages
- Deliverables
- Events/Outcomes

Current situation:

a) Project workpackages are visible on the separate web page with the list of proposed activities.
b) All project activities and deliverables and all events/outcomes are presented on the same main page in the table with many documents and are divided into categories:
    - deliverables
    - status
    - content
    - responsible partners

Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union

Suggestions for improvements:

List of activities: the list of proposed activities, together with a timeline is wrongly mentioned and reached under "The list of the deliverables (till M24)" which is in fact an Excel file. We suggest changing the title accordingly.

Deliverables: It is not clearly visible if final deliverables are in accordance with the deliverables, which has been proposed in the project content. Therefore, there is a missing list of project workpackages, activities together with proposed final deliverables.

For example, there is a missing mention on the following deliverable for the activity WP1, A1.1 "Evaluation of the existing doctoral education policy and standards in Montenegro and Albania and comparing with EU practices": "D1.1 Report on the "state of the art" in doc. edu in Montenegro and Albania and comparison with EU practices". We suggest improving the list. Example: https://www.ecesm.net/outputsoutcomes .

Events/Outcomes can be presented on the separate web page and not in the same web page. This web page can be clearly divided further into:

- project meetings (internal, general, other) and
- dissemination activities (workshops, conferences, TV shows, media, newsletters, round tables, web-pages, inter-erasmus, overall presentations, social networks)

2. Deliverables

Current situation:

On the workflow there are visible number of deliverables, which contains different information, like reports, minutes of the meetings etc.

The list is used as a proof for work under specific project workpackage activity, which was proposed in the project content.

Suggestions for improvements:

Deliverables are proposed in the project content as DX.X documents, therefore we suggest extending a project webpage site (https://www.mards.ucg.ac.me/project.html) with links to all proposed deliverables.

For example, we suggest for activity *A1.1 "Evaluation of the existing doctoral education policy and standards in Montenegro and Albania and comparing with EU practices"* to combine currently available two documents (Reports on state of the art and funding) into one document and present this as a deliverable for the activity A1.1. With this the following proposed deliverable will be reached: D1.1 Report on the "state of the art" in doc. edu in Montenegro and Albania and comparison with EU practices". It seems that the document for funding belong to another deliverable, to D3.1.

We suggest doing this with all other documents or reports which are now available in the workflow web page.

Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union

For final reports we suggest using a MARDS Word template which use all necessary elements for formatting the document. The template should be reached on the web page for "Documents" under the title "Visual indentity documents".

Current situation on deliverables and suggestions for improvements:

Deliverable	*Status*	*Suggestions for improvement*
D1.1	Ready	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D1.2	Ongoing	Partly done. Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D1.3	Ongoing	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D2.1	Not available	Links are not available.
D2.2	Not available	Links are not available.
D3.1	Ready	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D3.2	Missing	
D3.3	Missing	
D4.1	Ready	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D4.2	Ready	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D4.3	Ready	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D4.4	Ongoing	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D4.5	Missing	
D4.6	Ongoing	Partly done. Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D4.7	Missing	
D5.1	Finished	
D5.2	Ongoing	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D5.3.	Ready	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D5.4	Missing	
D6.1	Ready	Design of the web-site should be improved and extended
D6.2	Ongoing	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D6.3	Ongoing	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D6.4	Missing	
D7.1	Finished	
D7.2	Ready	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D7.3	Missing	
D8.1	Ongoing	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D8.2	Ongoing	Prepare one document as a report to deliverable.
D8.3	Ready	Prepare two documents (midterm and final)

Link to the table of activities and deliverables:

https://www.mards.ucg.ac.me/docs/MARDS%201st%20year%20tracker.xlsx

Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union

3. Events/Outcomes

Current situation:

At the web page for Workflow (https://www.mards.ucg.ac.me/workflow.html) there is a list of events/outcomes which contain different information, like for meetings, books, confirmation letters, seminars and dissemination activities.

Suggestions for improvements:

We suggest preparing three <u>separate web pages</u> named:

- Meetings (internal meetings, project meetings and other)
- Trainings
- Disseminations

Each web page should contain a clearly visible list of activities and links to documents.

<u>Photos</u>: instead of having photos in the list they can be put into a Photo Gallery with clear heading labels.

4. Evaluation of available documents

4.1 "Report of doctoral studies in Montenegro and Albania"

Positive aspects:

1. The document contains an overview of the current models and practices of funding doctoral studies in Montenegro and Albania. The report based on questionnaire which was sent to the representatives of partner universities.
2. It contains a clear description of funding on partner universities in Montenegro and in Albania.
3. It contains a clear and informative SWOT analysis of the current funding state in Montenegro and in Albania.
4. It contains recommendation for the new model of funding.

Suggestions for improvements:

1. The content:
    a. Historical need for doctoral studies is missing in terms of growing of number of students (in graphs),
    b. graphs of historical funding are missing,
    c. no statistical data are provided,
    d. only one reference is included.
2. Formatting of the document is necessary according to the MARDS Template

Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union

3. Typos:
    a. "Introduction" is mentioned twice
4. We suggest including tables for easier view to data collected

4.2 "The reports on equipment"

Positive aspects:

1. Documents are presented clearly laid out on the project website and are available for the public
2. The buying process is well documented by most partners, including tenders and timelines
3. Proof of acquired equipment is given via photo documentation by most partners

Suggestions for improvements:

1. An overall price table listing bought equipment and expenditures should be included together with description in English -> this would help the Quality Monitoring Committee and external evaluators to make a quick check on reasonability and comparability

2. A final statement that:
    a. all purchases are within the budget lines of the project; and
    b. receipts and invoices are collected and kept according to the projects and national regulations could be included in each report

3. The Quality Monitoring Committee is not familiar with the local language of the tenders, we trust that everything is in line with local and project regulations. We suggest including a short explanation of the process in English language

4.3 "MARDS Doktorski Program „Doktorske studije u održivom razvoju"

"Plan i Program" Curriculum Book is a Working version 1.1 and offers a very solid overview of doctoral programme oriented towards natural and technical sciences in sustainable development and eco-design. The Curriculum Book offers in its introductory part an overview of the Structure of the doctoral programme; learning outcomes; the overview of courses with their lecturers, status and ECTS; international collaboration; and conditions for inclusion in the programme. Then, the Curriculum Book continues with the list of courses and their syllabus which includes the description of the course, its content, objectives and competences and intended learning outcomes, learning and teaching methods, assessment and references for the course.

Positive aspects:

1. The Curriculum Book offers a robust overview on doctoral study programme oriented towards natural and technical sciences in sustainable development and eco-design.
2. The Curriculum Book has clear and informative structure.

Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union

3. The list of courses is attractive.
4. The list of courses and their content is very well prepared.

Suggestions for improvements:

Format:

1. The structure of the syllabus is not the same for all courses, in some cases some items are missing (e.g. course type, references), fonts, colours or size of letter are sometimes different – it will be nice if all courses have similar syllabus and formatting.
2. Consider the division of courses to several types, such as core courses, research method courses, etc. and probably consider their formatting accordingly.
3. Consider English translation of the introductory part of the Curriculum Book, such as Structure of the PhD. programme; learning outcomes; the overview of courses with their lecturers, status and ECTS; international collaboration; and conditions for inclusion in the programme.

Content:

1. The mobility (international/inter-sectoral) is not considered in the Curriculum Book.

4.4 "The key elements of MARDS sustainability"

The key elements of MARDS sustainability co-authored by Betim Cico and Radovan Stojanovic is a good a starting point for reflection on sustainability issues of the MARDS project and a solid basement for the project roadmap for sustainability.

The document has logical structure and provides in-depth analysis of achievements, elements of the project sustainability and recommendations.

The first two sections are devoted to overview of MARDS achievements in Albania and Montenegro. These two sections describe the achievements related with project MARDS such as empowering cooperation between universities or improving the educational infrastructure. Besides, both sections critically evaluate in more detail problems related with doctoral education and its implementation in both countries. The next section describes the possible eight elements of MARDS sustainability considering both, short- and long-term sustainability while considering academic, institutional and financial aspects. The next section is oriented towards recommendations for sustainability of the project MARDS. The last section concludes with the most important points and further steps for the project sustainability.

Positive aspects:

1. The document contains clear and informative overview of the project MARDS achievements in Montenegro and in Albania.
2. The document identifies short- and long-term sustainability measures considering academic, institutional and financial aspects of sustainability measures.
3. The document contains eight recommendation for the overall sustainability of the project.

Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union

4. The document highlights the complexity of the project sustainability and the need for synergic and collaborative approach between project and stakeholders to meet the overall project sustainability.

Suggestions for improvements:

1. To define the clear objective/s of the sustainability strategy.
2. To identify persons responsible for sustainability of the project.
3. To develop a plan for assessing the progress in project sustainability with timeline.
4. To involve the sustainability of improved educational infrastructure through continued operation and maintenance of project facilities.

4.5. "Dissemination Plan"

The following quality check report present an intermediate evaluation of deliverables related to **Dissemination Plan.**

According to the **MARDS - Dissemination Plan**
Version 1.0 // 25-01-2019, Authors: Michael Wimmer, Lucas Zinner
Part of WP 6, WP lead: Metropolitan University Tirana

The main aim of this plan was to encourage the project visibility and outcomes within and outside the partnership. All partners should have contributed to the dissemination of the project using their own channels of communication. The dissemination activities took place at the local level and the European level.

The following deliverable are linked to the plan:

D6.1 Setting up and maintaining the project web site

D6.2 Dissemination material created and distributed

D6.3 Dissemination events with relevant stakeholders organised

D6.4 MARDS doctorial Colloquium organised

D6.1 Setting up and maintaining the project website

Website is set up and maintained by the coordinator. The project information is also disseminated through the social networks (Facebook page of the project and partner universities, if they have them). Project website contains information for the public, where all information about the project is available, and one part is for project partners, for the project management purposes (project documents, works plans, financial management documents, visual identity, and preparation documents for project activities, easily accessible).

Partner universities shared the information about the project on their own websites. Information regarding the project was published in Albanian and Montenegrin media (internet portals, newspapers) as well as in the media,

Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union

articles and newsletters in partner countries. Proof of that can be found on the project's website. Minutes, agendas and photos of all workshops and conferences are also published on the website.

D6.2 Dissemination material created and distributed

Dissemination materials and visual identity documents were designed and distributed during all the events and project activities. Documents such as MARDS Logo, MARDS presentation template, Memorandum, Poster by University Metropolitan, display slides (for TV), Roll-up, small flags are available at the project's website.

Both 6.1. and 6.2 deliverables are done according to plan.

D6.3 Dissemination events with relevant stakeholders organised

Project meetings, coordination meetings, workshops, trainings, info days, round tables, and all other events were organised according to the plan from the beginning of the project. In the 2nd project year, at the beginning of 2020. the COVID 19 pandemic affected the project activities and moved some meetings and activities in the virtual environment and some od them were postponed.

D6.4 MARDS doctorial Colloquium organised

MARDS Doctoral Colloquium will be very important dissemination and exploitation event and will be organized at the end of the project.

Suggestions for improvements:

1. More dissemination events are organized in Montenegro than in Albania, we recommend for Albanian partners to increase the number of dissemination events.

Dr. Matjaž Debevc
Chair of the Quality Monitoring Committe

Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union